

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO  
EASTERN DIVISION

**OurPet's Company,**

Plaintiff,

v.

**Loving Pets,**

Defendant.

Case No. 1:15-cv-768

Judge Polster

**PLAINTIFF'S ANSWER TO THE  
DEFENDANT'S COUNTERCLAIM**

NOW COMES the Plaintiff, *OurPet's Company*, and pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(a)(1)(B), Plaintiff hereby submits its Answer to the Defendant's Counterclaim as follows:

1. In respect to Paragraph 1 of Defendant's Counterclaim, Plaintiff admits Defendant has cited certain statutory authority, but denies that Defendant is entitled to any such requested relief.
2. Plaintiff admits Paragraphs 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, and 7 of Defendant's Counterclaim.
3. Plaintiff denies Paragraph 8 and 9 of Defendant's Counterclaim.
4. In respect to Paragraph 10 of Defendant's Counterclaim, Plaintiff incorporates by reference Paragraph Nos. 1 – 9 as though fully restated herein.
5. Plaintiff denies Paragraphs 11 and 12 of Defendant's Counterclaim.
6. In respect to Paragraph 13 of Defendant's Counterclaim, Plaintiff incorporates by reference Paragraph Nos. 1 – 12 as though fully restated herein.
7. Plaintiff denies Paragraphs 14 and 15 of Defendant's Counterclaim.

**Affirmative Defenses**

1. Defendant's Counterclaim fails to state a claim upon which relief can be granted.

2. Defendant's products infringe upon Plaintiff's asserted patents.
3. The Plaintiff's patents in suit are valid and enforceable.

Wherefore, Plaintiff requests the Court to enter an Order in favor of the Plaintiff on all of the Plaintiff's claims as stated in Plaintiff's Amended Complaint, and enter an Order in favor of the Plaintiff and against the Defendant on all of the Defendant's Counterclaims, and dismiss the Defendant's Counterclaims with prejudice, and award Plaintiff the relief so requested in its Complaint.

Plaintiff further requests a trial by jury on all issues so triable.

Most Respectfully Submitted,

/s/ David A. Welling

**C. VINCENT CHOKEN (0070530)**

**DAVID A. WELLING (0075934)**

CHOKEN WELLING LLP

55 S. Mille Rd., Ste. 203

Akron, Ohio 44333

Tel. (330) 865 – 4949

Fax (330) 865 – 3777

vincec@choken-welling.com

davidw@choken-welling.com

*Counsel for the Plaintiff*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

This is to certify that on the date electronically time-stamped above that this document was transmitted via the Court's electronic filing system to all parties of record.

/s/ David A. Welling  
**C. VINCENT CHOKEN (0070530)**  
**DAVID A. WELLING (0075934)**

*Counsel for the Plaintiff*